

See discussions, stats, and author profiles for this publication at:  
<https://www.researchgate.net/publication/277666391>

# Marking the Centenary of the 1911 Revolution Martyrs' Shrines and the Memory of the 1911 Revolution During the Republican Era

Article *in* Chinese Studies in History · October 2012

---

CITATIONS

0

---

READS

28

2 authors, including:



Nan Wang

Nanjing University

2 PUBLICATIONS 0 CITATIONS

SEE PROFILE

WANG NAN AND CHEN YUNQIAN

## Marking the Centenary of the 1911 Revolution

### Martyrs' Shrines and the Memory of the 1911 Revolution During the Republican Era

*Abstract: During the Republican era, traditional shrines to fallen soldiers in various places were converted into shrines commemorating the martyrs of the 1911 Revolution. Martyrs' shrines thus became places of memory for the 1911 Revolution. Revolutionary martyrs' shrines occupied an important position within the Republican era's locus for remembering the 1911 Revolution and gradually attained sacred status as part of the national worship system. Although the martyrs' shrines of the Republican era preserved the form of traditional shrines, their memorial rites and interior displays were similar to yet different from old-style shrines: they were multifunctional spaces integrating worship and exhibition, which transformed the traditional space for worship into a sacred vehicle for modern national memory. This caused the people who entered the space to feel respect and admiration for the martyrs and form a profound memory of the Revolution. As a vehicle for*

---

English translation © 2013 M.E. Sharpe, Inc., from the Chinese text, “Lieshi ci yu minguo shiqi Xinhai geming jiyi,” *Minguo dan'gan* (Republican Archives), 3 (2011). Translated by Carissa Fletcher.

Wang Nan is a graduate student at the Research Center of Republican History, Nanjing University. Chen Yunqian is her adviser and a professor at the center.

*national memory during the prewar era, martyrs' shrines played an important role as nationalistic symbols. At the same time, due to the influence of traditional regionalism, martyrs' shrines also became vehicles of regional memory.*

The purpose of ancestral shrines was “to worship and sacrifice to the ancestors”: at the same time, they were also important sites where clans discussed their internal affairs. They first emerged during the Han dynasty as graveside shrines used for sacrificing to the ancestors. They later evolved into the ancestral shrine that was the basis of the clan system, then branched out into shrines to deities, sages' temples, and shrines to fallen soldiers. These shrines fell into the categories of clan shrines, personal shrines, and national shrines: among these categories, the clan shrines were the most numerous in China. To encourage its subjects to pledge loyalty to the state, however, the imperial court granted certain individuals or ministers who had made contributions to the state the honor of constructing a shrine for them and constructed collective shrines to fallen soldiers on the site of the battlefield or in their hometowns. Based on Chinese people's traditional beliefs and customs, worship in shrines was different from other memorial rites: after the sages' temples or Qing dynasty shrines to the fallen were converted into martyrs' shrines in the Republican era, shrines became the most sacred space for commemorating the 1911 Revolution.<sup>1</sup> As a site for the national worship of revolutionary martyrs, martyrs' shrines occupied an important position within the Republican era's space for remembering the 1911 Revolution and gradually attained sacred status as part of the national worship system. However, the establishment of the martyrs' shrines and the expression of their role was not an instant success: rather, the shrines experienced a process of transformation from traditional into modern memorial space.

### **The Conversion of Ancestral Shrines and the Transformation of Memory**

Traditional Chinese dynasties always emphasized the dissemination of traditional values through sages' temples, constructing a

social memory that suited their own needs. The Qing government constructed a multitude of shrines to the fallen, the aim of which was to draw on the worship of those who sacrificed themselves for the country to “encourage reverence for political integrity and commend moral virtue, so as to see and hear the flowering of loyal and righteous hearts near and far.”<sup>2</sup> Although the Republic of China was a modern nation, it was, after all, a nation founded on the soil of a traditional culture: its traditional sacrificial culture still had influence, and in the minds of the people ancestral shrines were still sacred sites for remembering the ancestors. After the founding of the republic, due to the need to rapidly placate the people and propagate republicanism, commemoration of the revolutionary martyrs became an urgent priority. The government of the newly founded nation also faced difficulties in terms of finances, manpower, and material resources: therefore, the conversion of traditional ancestral shrines into the memorial space of the modern nation was the government’s inevitable choice.

Following the establishment of the new republic, the Department of the Army issued an order to convert the Qing dynasty shrines to the fallen into shrines to loyal heroes and martyrs:

With the five-colored flag splendidly flying, Wuhan led the nation in establishing a republic: the multitude of martyrs who died for their country gave their heads as the price of the republic. Yet their names risk falling into oblivion: it is urgent that perpetual sacrificial rites be held for these loyal souls who endured a hundred perils. Facing the Manchu tyrants, these patriots held high the flag. The Qing dynasty shrines to the fallen should all be converted into shrines to loyal heroes and martyrs, and the martyrs of this province who loyally died for the republic should be collectively celebrated: every year on August 19, the memorial day of the Wuhan Uprising, and February 15, the memorial day of the unification of the republic, we shall diligently and perpetually hold memorial ceremonies. This shall accomplish the threefold purpose of soothing the spirits of the departed and rousing the living so as to show the righteousness of reward and punishment.<sup>3</sup>

The new political regime directly converted the Qing dynasty shrines to the fallen into shrines to heroes and martyrs, altering the spatial meaning of the original shrines. The original shrines were

deemed “shrines to unorthodox gods”: the memory of the fallen figures who were once worshipped there was also completely negated. The newly enshrined martyrs, however, represented a new value orientation: only those who had died for the revolution were true martyrs with the right to be worshipped. In addition, the bodies of many martyrs had been lost, and it was thus difficult to set graves for them: enshrining their spirit tablet was a way to remedy this. The Department of the Army also suggested the establishment of unified memorial days for holding memorial ceremonies, so as to integrate the special significance of the martyrs’ shrines with the temporal significance of the Wuchang Uprising and the day of the unification of the nation: the intention was to more effectively develop the sense of “righteousness reward and punishment” in the new regime and add depth to society’s memory of the revolutionary martyrs.

Following the Taiping Heavenly Kingdom Movement, the victorious Xiang, Chu, and Huai armies established innumerable shrines for those who had fallen on the battlefield.<sup>4</sup> These shrines to the fallen were the principal target of the Department of the Army’s conversion efforts. On the one hand, these shrines had been constructed relatively recently and were numerous in quantity, making conversion fairly easy; on the other hand, in the eyes of the revolutionaries, the peasant army of the Taiping Heavenly Kingdom was the forerunner of anti-Qing sentiment, while the loyal Han servants of the Manchus who suppressed them were not worthy of commemoration. Therefore, in its public notice announcing the reconstruction in each province, the Department of the Army instructed every province “to rapidly convert the shrines to the fallen of the Xiang, Chu, and Huai armies into great martyrs’ shrines,” “first to soothe the souls of the martyrs in Heaven, and second to deprive the spirits of the traitors to China.”<sup>5</sup> “This will save on construction costs and clearly demonstrate righteous reward and punishment.”<sup>6</sup>

The government discriminated among the original shrines: only those shrines that propagated the idea of loyalty to the Manchu Qing were on the list to be converted. The government had no wish to completely subvert the former social value system and therefore

respected the other shrines, as they did not impede the construction of the new memory of the revolution. The government also denied the legitimacy of the shrines to the fallen, while the enshrinement of republican martyrs facilitated the formation of new customs and culture.

The martyrs' shrine in the city of Changde, Hunan province, was originally a shrine to the fallen built during the Jiaqing reign (1796–1820) and consecrated to several generations of fallen soldiers. Every fall and spring, after sacrificing to Confucius at the Confucian temple, local officials, gentry, elders, and students inevitably went to this shrine to the fallen to offer sacrifices and conduct ceremonies: this became a routine public ceremony. After the founding of the republic, local figures recommended that the shrine to the fallen be converted into a shrine to the martyrs of the 1911 Revolution. The first public memorial ceremony for the revolutionary martyrs was held on October 10, 1912: the participants included 800 local officials, elders and gentry, representatives of various social groups, students, and city residents; the county magistrate of Changde county officiated and the leading Nationalist Party cadre of Changde, Zhang Jiong 張炯, took charge of distributing the sacrifices. The form of the rite was similar to that of the old-style public ceremony, but there were differences: they did not kneel three times and touch their heads to the ground nine times but only bowed; and participants also gave speeches.<sup>7</sup> Not only had the nature of the shrine been altered, the object of sacrifice had been changed: local sacrificial ceremonies changed as well, demonstrating the results of the republic's transformation of social conditions. However, the sacredness of the martyrs' shrines was preserved. After this, public sacrifices were held every year at appointed times, ending only with the outbreak of war.

In 1907 in Anqing, Xu Xilin 徐錫麟 (1873–1907) assassinated En Ming 恩銘 (1845–1907) at the Anqing Police Academy. En Ming's subordinates constructed a Shrine to Mourn the Loyal En on this site for him. After the founding of the republic, at the suggestion of Sun Yat-sen, Xu Xilin's students established a Police Academy Alumni Association and converted the En Shrine into a shrine to Xu Xilin: this would help later generations remember his

revolutionary deeds and especially the heroism of his self-sacrifice. In addition, the establishment of the En Ming Shrine represented the Qing government's suppression of the revolution: abolishing it carried the significance of overturning the Qing dynasty and avenging the martyr.

The shrine to Xu Xilin in his hometown of Shaoxing was also a converted building. To express their commemoration of the martyr, local people petitioned to convert the Liao Shrine in the city of Shaoxing into a shrine to Xu. The Xu Shrine was originally a site for the worship of the prefectural magistrate of Shaoxing, Liao Zongyuan 廖宗元 (1810–1861), who was killed by the Taiping Army during the Qing dynasty Xianfeng reign (1850–1861). The people of Shaoxing petitioned the government to convert this building into a shrine to Xu: the Zhejiang provincial governor approved the request and commended “the destruction of the unorthodox shrine to a Qing minister, letting the hidden light of the patriot shine, bringing down the executioner's axe on imperialism and obtaining justice.”<sup>8</sup> The converted Xu Shrine held innate implications of anti-Qing revolution.

In addition, some martyrs' shrines were converted from temples. The shrine to Yang Zhenhong 楊振鴻 (1874–1909) in Yunnan was a converted religious space. The commander of the Yunnan military government, Li Genyuan 李根源 (1879–1965), constructed a shrine to Yang in Tengchong county by converting the Hall of the Five Emperors. The Hall of the Five Emperors was also the place where the oath of alliance for the Tengyu Uprising led by Zhang Wenguang 張文光 (1881–1913) had been sworn: it was thus not only a temple but also the old site of revolutionary activities. Li Genyuan composed a couplet for the shrine, highly praising the revolutionary contributions of the martyrs.<sup>9</sup> Other martyrs' shrines were converted from clan shrines. The shrine to Yu Peilun 喻培倫 (1886–1911) was converted from the Yu Family Ancestral Shrine in Yu's hometown of Neijiang, Sichuan: the courtyard and two wings of the shrine became display areas for Yu Peilun's deeds, while the room facing the courtyard became the Public Memorial Hall.<sup>10</sup>

The residences of Qing officials were also converted into martyrs' shrines. In 1912, the Department of the Army noted that the two

martyrs Yang Zhuolin 楊卓林 (1876–1907) and Zheng Ziyu 鄭子瑜 were “both devoted to national affairs, both killed by Duan Fang 端方 (1861–1911), both died in Nanjing,” and therefore requested that Duan Fang’s private house be converted into a shrine for the two martyrs Yang and Zheng. The president approved the request and recommended that Wu Yue 吳樾, Xiong Chengji 熊成基, and Yang Dusheng 楊篤生, who unsuccessfully plotted to bomb Duan Fang and later died for their country, also be enshrined. Although the martyr Chen Tianhua 陳天華 (1875–1905) had not been able to personally commit a virtuous act, the books he wrote instilled nationalism in his countrymen and had a great impact: therefore, the president also recommended that he be enshrined.<sup>11</sup> The five martyrs Yang, Zheng, Wu, Xiong, and Chen were all connected to the Qing official Duan Fang: converting Duan Fang’s residence into a martyrs’ shrine was an effort to help the people form a profound memory of the history of the martyrs’ struggle against the Qing government.

The conversion of shrines was the basic means of constructing martyrs’ shrines during the Republican era, especially in the early years of the republic. This not only saved on financial and material costs but also most directly and effectively subverted the memorial space for traditional loyalty to the Qing dynasty. In sum, the conversion of traditional shrines into republican martyrs’ shrines transformed the traditional memorial space for loyalty to the emperor into modern revolutionary memorial space.

### **Space and Ceremony: The Molding of Revolutionary Memory**

Martyrs’ shrines were special memorial spaces: unlike cemeteries, they were not essentialized space but rather were memorial spaces constructed by later generations; therefore, they relied on the spatial arrangement of displays and the design of ceremonial performances to make the space sacred.

A typical case of the use of shrines to mold space for revolutionary memory was the Xu Shrine in Xu Xilin’s hometown of Shaoxing. Most shrines included a spirit tablet: making offerings to the

spirit tablet was the most important ceremony for shrines and the perpetuation of China's traditional funereal rites. This rite, however, was somewhat altered: for instance, the police and troops participated in the ceremony and political figures representing the nation gave speeches. On June 10, 1912, Shaoxing held a grand ceremony to worship the martyrs Xu Xilin, Chen Boping 陳伯平, and Ma Zonghan 馬宗漢. The prestige of the troops' respectful offerings to the spirit tablets was especially impressive.<sup>12</sup> The police and troops leading the way represented the political authorities' reverence for the Xu Shrine: pavilions scattered among the troops displayed Xu Xilin's relics—including a globe, a pistol, and bloodstained clothes, which not only demonstrated Xu Xilin's contributions to education but also showed his heroic death.

Traditional society's worship of enshrined figures had been transferred to reverence for martyrs. On that day, the crowd's enthusiasm was running high, and there were many spectators, with "no lack [of people] along the path of the public memorial ceremony"; even the vendors' stands contributed money for offerings.<sup>13</sup> By constructing a shrine, the people of Zhejiang hoped that the people would "never forget their origins or fail to appreciate their bounty" and would know that the republican world presently under construction, in which the people could enjoy the happiness of liberty and peace, existed due to the martyrs' sacrifice of their heads and sprinkling of their warm blood.<sup>14</sup> The crowd's feelings of reverence on that day indicate that the Xu Shrine indeed had the effect of strengthening the people's revolutionary memory.

Although the Xu Shrine had already been completed, long-term maintenance of the shrine would not be guaranteed without a special managing body. To this end, Xu Xilin's followers, friends, and relatives organized the Xu Society, the grounds for which were established within the shrine.<sup>15</sup> The constitution of the Xu Society stipulated that members must be devoted to managing the property of the Xu Shrine, collecting relics of Xu Xilin and the other martyrs enshrined there, and holding an annual memorial ceremony on July 8, the date of Xu Xilin's martyrdom.<sup>16</sup> The Xu Society also gave stipulations for the compositions of worship, rites, and offerings for the memorial ceremony. In the compositions of worship, the

members of the Xu Society expressed the hope that “the principle of the emperor has forever been cast off; long live the Republic.” In reality, commemoration of martyrs was essentially also meant to propagate revolutionary memory and instill revolutionary pursuits into the people’s minds. Because the Xu Society was engaged full-time in managing the shrine, its memorial activities could be maintained over a long period. For instance, in 1920, although chaos had repeatedly broken out in the country, on July 8, the Xu Society still held a large-scale sacrificial offering at the Xu Shrine: “Officials filled the courtyard in a rather magnificent scene.”<sup>17</sup> The memorial activities directed by the Xu Society began the year of the founding of the republic and were held magnificently every year according to schedule until the Japanese army occupied Shaoxing in 1941.

Under the management of the Xu Society, the interior space of the Xu Shrine was also painstakingly decorated until it brimmed with commemorative significance: the shrine thus was no longer merely a vehicle for traditional beliefs and customs but rather became a memory device for publicizing the revolutionary career of the martyr. The shrine had a niche for the ancestral tablet, at the center of which was placed a portrait of Xu Xilin: the pistol with which Xu Xilin shot and killed En Ming and the bloodstained clothes in which he died a martyr were also on display, using material objects to exhibit the revolutionary history of the Xu Xilin Uprising.<sup>18</sup> Clearly, the Xu Shrine was not an ancestral shrine in the traditional sense but rather dually played the exhibitivite role of a memorial hall: this was a manifestation of the transition from traditional to modern memorial space.

The shrine also had a stone stele with an inscription composed by Cai Yuanpei 蔡元培, which narrated in detail the circumstances of Xu Xilin’s martyrdom and introduced the origin of the shrine.<sup>19</sup> Cai Yuanpei suggested that more martyrs’ posthumous writings be collected along with their clothing and books and placed in the shrine, “so that visitors may repeatedly tour and have their minds enlightened; so that they may not view this as spirits and idols, or merely as the worship of virtue and recompense for the contributions of restless spirits.”<sup>20</sup> Cai Yuanpei hoped not merely that

people would remember the history of the martyrs, but furthermore that people would be inspired by the memory of the revolution to struggle for democracy. Therefore, although both traditional and modern shrines were memorial spaces, differences in terms of beliefs led to differences in the form of commemoration.

Constructing dedicated shrines to certain martyrs or attaching them to local collective martyrs' shrines was the highest praise and reward for martyrs, and the enshrining ceremony was the optimal method for declaring publicly to the people the status of the martyrs. Due to factional disputes and other reasons, the martyr of Zhenjiang, Tao Junbao 陶駿保, was killed by his own side during the revolution and was also charged by Chen Yingshi 陳英士 with "withholding ammunition and hindering military operations."<sup>21</sup> After Tao Junbao was rehabilitated, Wang Liting 王立廷 and others requested that a dedicated shrine be established.<sup>22</sup> The Beijing government affirmed Tao Junbao's contributions and permitted the construction of a dedicated shrine as a symbol of his rehabilitation. Through its solicitude for Tao Junbao, the government testified to its own righteous worship of virtue and recompense for contributions.

In November 1913, the gentry, merchants, and scholars of Zhenjiang, including Zhang Wenquan 張文銓 and some twenty others, petitioned the county government to set aside the open space on the western side of the Beigu Mountain Zhuwen Temple for the construction of a shrine.<sup>23</sup> On February 11, 1917, the ceremony for the enshrinement of the memorial tablet and statue was held. Spectators formed a solid wall along the entire route, and it was an extraordinarily lively scene. After the statue arrived at the shrine, it was placed in the center of the great ground-floor hall, and the memorial tablet was placed before it: once the sacrificial ceremony to the memorial tablet had been held, it was moved to the altar table upstairs. A stele inscription recounting the life of Tao Junbao was also mounted within the shrine.<sup>24</sup> A eulogy banner written by President Li Yuanhong 黎元洪 hung in the main hall of the shrine: it read, "Stirring and inspiring." Vice President Ma Guozhang's 馮國璋 banner read: "Loyal heart, blood shed in a just cause." The couplet read: "This figure of Jiangshan was rent from us: through trials and hardships, the spirit of the martyr instigated an angry tide."

In addition, many local scholarly groups or individuals contributed numerous votive tablets.<sup>25</sup>

The contingent sending off the spirit fused traditional funereal rites with modern forms of condolences, using not only unusual displays and a statue to demonstrate the large scale of the ceremony but also lined-up ranks of participating soldiers and policemen to indicate the status of the enshrined figure. The enthusiastic participation of students further added color to the contingent. The crowd was moved by this ostentation, and the route all the way to the Tao Shrine was densely packed with people: the Tao Shrine thus became a household word, imperceptibly adding depth to the people's understanding and memory of Tao Junbao.

In some places, the enshrinement ceremonies for the martyrs' shrines were more complex, with a more traditional flavor. In May 1916, a mourning ceremony was held at the Yunnan martyrs' shrine for those who fell in the National Protection Movement: several streets in Kunming were draped with white cloth, blocking out the sky, and a series of pine and cypress memorial arches were erected along the street. Plays were performed at the martyrs' shrine for three successive evenings, allowing the city residents to spontaneously watch the shows: this was China's traditional custom of "funereal plays."<sup>26</sup> The enshrinement ceremony of the Yunnan martyrs' shrine combined traditional funereal rites with a revolutionary memorial ceremony. Although some of these customs were already seen as corrupt during the republican era, such as the "funereal plays," which the Qing dynasty had repeatedly attempted to ban after its invasion, they still appeared in the martyrs' memorial ceremony: this indicates that the martyrs' shrine, in serving as a form of traditional memorial space, also absorbed the attendant traditional funereal rites, which may have slightly weakened its role as a revolutionary memorial. Absorbing traditional spatial arrangements and funereal rites into martyrs' memorials, however, also had a positive significance: this could make it easier for the people of China to accept the shrines, and it facilitated their formation of feelings of worship, reverence, and respect for the martyrs, thus promoting the development of a profound revolutionary memory—although this type of revolutionary memory was not necessarily very pure.

## National Memory and Nationalistic Symbols

The martyrs' shrines were memorial spaces established to commemorate the soldiers who sacrificed themselves for their country: therefore, in the early days of their establishment, they were already preset as vehicles for national memory, playing the role of a nationalistic symbol.

Feng Yuxiang 馮玉祥 (1882–1948) was a surviving leader of the Luanzhou Uprising: he had always hoped to exalt the spirits of the martyrs who died in the uprising and to give society a proper understanding of the Luanzhou Uprising. Therefore, despite a perilous political environment, when garrisoned at Langfang (Hebei), he established a shrine to the fallen and enshrined the spirit tablets of nine martyrs of the Luanzhou Uprising. In 1923, he was garrisoned at South Park in Beijing, and again in Beijing he constructed a martyrs' shrine.<sup>27</sup> On October 10 of that year, he gave an address to the leading army officers:

First, today is October 10, namely Double Tenth Day, or the birthday of China's national flag: we commemorate it, so as not to forget that our nation was founded with iron and blood and must be protected with iron and blood. Second, today there are three things that may be commemorated: the first is that a new president has assumed office; the second is that today at 10:00 A.M. the Constitution of the Republic of China was promulgated; and the third is that the republic was established through the Wuchang Uprising. Third, nine people, including the great army commander of the Luanzhou Uprising, Wang Jinming 王金銘, and Commander-in-Chief Shi Congyun 施從雲 were murdered, and now they have all been enshrined in the Beijing martyrs' shrine: they were soldiers who loved and protected their country. The truth must be discovered sometimes: all of you may narrate the details of these circumstances.<sup>28</sup>

Double Tenth Day was National Day: this day demonstrated the essence of the 1911 Revolution that established the republic. There were many uprisings in the course of the revolution, however, and not all could retain their proper place in society's memory as true revolutionary uprisings, as the Wuchang Uprising did. On that day, Feng Yuxiang emphasized to the officers the significance of

establishing a martyrs' shrine: the goal was to demonstrate that the Luanzhou Uprising was an important element of the 1911 Revolution, which point would eventually be approved by society. While expounding on the significance of constructing a martyrs' shrine, he emphasized that the commemoration of martyrs was actually for the sake of the nation.

After the Manchurian Incident (September 18, 1931, or 9.18.1931), a national crisis was at hand: the idea of drawing on the commemoration of martyrs to inspire society to resist Japan manifested even more strongly in the construction of the shrine to the martyrs of the Luanzhou Uprising. After the January 28 Incident (1932), the situation was critical: Feng Yuxiang proposed sending in more troops to aid the Nineteenth Route Army in the Songhu Battle of Resistance (Shanghai) but was prevented: he resigned in anger and retired to Puzhao Temple on Mount Tai. There, hoping to grant the martyrs of the Luanzhou Uprising the same degree of renown as the famous mountain, Feng again began construction of a shrine. In 1933, he chose a secluded forest in Puzhao as the site of his shrine, and he personally led the soldiers in expanding the foundations and constructing the shrine.<sup>29</sup>

The outer eastern wall of the shrine was inscribed with "Monument to the Completion of the Mount Tai Martyrs' Shrine": on the monument was inscribed a poem by Li Weicheng 李维诚: "Everywhere we have driven out the stinking enemy. Adding new tears to the Yellow Flower Mound, one death truly is as weighty as Mount Tai." The "stinking enemy" refers to the overthrow of the Manchus; the vestiges of late Qing racism were still revealed many years later in the memory of the 1911 Revolution. The poem also placed the martyrs of the Luanzhou Uprising on a par with those of the Yellow Flower Mound, emphasizing that the Luanzhou Uprising was a revolutionary element of the Xinhai Revolution and expressing reverence for the martyrs. At the time, the Yellow Flower Mound had already become an important revolutionary symbol in the collective memory of the people: Feng and others now hoped that the Luanzhou uprising could also be as broadly commemorated as the Yellow Flower Mound.<sup>30</sup>

The martyrs of the uprising faced the risk of being forgotten, so

Feng Yuxiang “constructed the shrine to worship the martyrs, so that they may not fall into oblivion.” However, Feng Yuxiang most wanted to inform society about the present situation:

With the sudden arrival of the unfortunate Manchurian Incident, we had no way to resist foreign aggression: thus our border strongholds have fallen to the enemy, and the encroachments of the foreign invaders worsen daily. The site where the new republican government plotted revolution for our generation today has been reduced to a foreign land; and the four provinces of Feng, Jilin, Heilongjiang, and Rehe have successively been captured. The Great Wall has been overrun, and the protective screen of North China is in jeopardy. In light of the original intentions of the martyrs of the revolution, is this not profound suffering!<sup>31</sup>

The aim in establishing the shrine was not only to give the right name to the Luanzhou Uprising but even more to rouse the government and society, in the hope that they could carry on the revolutionary spirit of the martyrs, protect the national territory, and muster their courage to fight the enemy. Advocacy of resistance against the Japanese was thus written into the memory of revolutionary martyrs. Before the main hall, the phrase “Resist the Japanese and save the nation” was written out in cobblestones.<sup>32</sup> This slogan expressed the meaning of carrying on the struggle to save the people, which at the time meant resisting the Japanese. Feng Yuxiang and others believed that the memory of the Luanzhou Uprising was a component of national memory and expressed that the struggle must be continued, by which they meant the Resistance against the Japanese.

Feng Yuxiang gave special attention to rebuilding every sort of memorial space so as to move the people’s hearts. During the War of Resistance against the Japanese, he sought to soothe the spirits of the soldiers who died in battle in that war: in the martyrs’ shrine he had established in Zhengzhou, which enshrined over twenty memorial tablets, he added a certain number of memorial tablets for martyrs of the Resistance. At the same time, in front of the entrance to the Pichang Temple, he installed a kneeling iron statue of the traitor Wang Jingwei 汪精衛 and his wife.<sup>33</sup> The martyrs of the Resistance and the martyrs of 1911, who similarly sacrificed

themselves for the nation and the people, shared a revolutionary spirit and could therefore coexist in the same shrine. The installation of the kneeling statue of Wang Jingwei and his wife used a comparative method of rewarding loyalty and punishing treachery to express society's strong nationalistic feelings: the positioning of the kneeling statue before the martyrs' shrine emphasized the shrine's role as a nationalistic symbol and further reinforced the spatial nature of the martyrs' shrines. This point demonstrates that the martyrs' shrines were the representatives of national memory and played a role as nationalistic symbols.

### **Martyrs' Shrines and Local Memory**

Martyrs' shrines were generally constructed in the martyrs' hometowns: the few established in other places often intentionally gave prominence to the martyrs' original birthplace. Therefore, martyrs' shrines carried a marked characteristic of regionalism and frequently became the vehicles for local memory, generating many contradictions between local and national memory.

During the era of the Nanjing National Government, the government placed little value on certain martyrs' memorial spaces. After the completion of the Nanjing Zhejiang Martyrs' Shrine, it was stipulated that a public memorial ceremony would be held twice annually in the spring and the fall, so as to soothe the loyal souls. For various reasons, however, these ceremonies were not held according to schedule; furthermore, the shrine was poorly managed for a long period and was even occupied by squatters. The original bronze plaque on the monument in the shrine was also stolen. The Zhejiang Native Place Association noticed this bleak situation and tried to reclaim the buildings and repair them; it also sent letters requesting the government to grant protection, so as to confer honor on the virtuous. On March 24, 1935, the Native Place Association distributed a circular inviting other native place members to participate in a public memorial ceremony.<sup>34</sup> On the day of the ceremony, representatives from the Zhejiang Provincial Government, the Ningbo Native Place Association, and businessmen in the capital all laid wreaths to pay their respects; the Native

Place Association took charge of the reception.<sup>35</sup> It is clear that the members of the Zhejiang Native Place Association primarily acted to protect and manage the shrine. This anecdote demonstrates that the government and especially the Nanjing municipal government placed little value on this shrine and illustrates how difficult it was for the limited regional revolutionary memory of that shrine to obtain recognition in other places.

Many individuals who presented requests to the government to enshrine martyrs belonged to the same native place as the martyr: they knew all about the martyr's deeds, did not wish for the person to sink into oblivion, and hoped they could use the shrine to commemorate the local martyr. For instance, in Sichuan, Huang Fusheng 黄复生, Li Zhaofu 李肇甫, and many other people presented petitions to soothe the souls of four martyrs born in Sichuan: Zou Rong 邹容, Xie Fengqi 谢奉琦, Yu Peilun, and Peng Jiazhen 彭家珍:

Following the outbreak of the unrest over the Sichuan railway, places across the nation successively responded; and after many months, the republic was founded. Its success is not due to the strength of one hand: in fact, its seeds were planted over several decades. The people of Sichuan dedicated themselves to the revolution, and the numbers who died in the revolts are incalculable. Among these, those who made distinguished contributions and should be offered recognition first include Zou Rong, Xie Fengqi, Yu Peilun, and Peng Jiazhen.<sup>36</sup>

There were regional differences in the memory of the Xinhai Revolution: to the people of Sichuan, the Railway Protection Movement of Sichuan province was an important spark for the revolution. During the preparations for the revolution, the contributions of the people of Sichuan cannot be trivialized: the commendation of martyrs born in Sichuan signified the affirmation of the Sichuan people's contributions. At that time, martyrs from other provinces, such as Wu Yue 吴越, were all receiving commendation: therefore, according to precedent, Zou Rong and the others should have also been commended. Sometime later, the president sent a memo approving and announcing the contributions of these Sichuan martyrs: this memo publicized to the whole of society the contributions that the Sichuan people had made to the revolution. To the people of Sichuan, gaining

the honor of the president's approval deepened their identification with the revolution: these few martyrs were the first batch of Sichuan natives who were commended, giving the Sichuan people a more profound memory of them.

Peng Jiazhen was one of the instigators of the Luanzhou Uprising: after the failure of the uprising, he died as a martyr following his assassination of Liang Bi 良弼 (1877–1912). In his memorial composition to various martyrs, Provisional President Sun Yat-sen personally commended “my old Peng, who took a bullet as a contribution [to his country],” and conferred on Peng Jiazhen the title of senior general, granting him enshrinement in a shrine to the fallen.<sup>37</sup> In light of the outstanding exploits of the martyr Peng, however, various groups had plans to establish a dedicated shrine for him. In 1912, the director of the Sichuan Province Education Association and others requested the Sichuan governor to authorize the establishment of a dedicated shrine to Peng Jiazhen at the site of the Qing dynasty Ding or Feng shrines.<sup>38</sup> In 1917, Sichuan Congress members Li Zhaofu 李肇夫 and others again petitioned for the construction of a shrine to Peng Jiazhen. The petition referred to several famous martyrs of the 1911 Revolution, such as Xu Xilin, Huang Xing 黃興, Cai E 蔡愕, and others who had already received grand memorials, though Peng Jiazhen's contributions were not inferior to theirs. In this light, “despite the magnitude of the martyr's contributions to the nation, the state's ceremonies to reward such services appear minuscule.”<sup>39</sup> The people of each locality wished that the state would grant importance to their local martyrs: the Sichuan people's dissatisfaction with the situation of memorials to Peng Jiazhen was thus, in reality, dissatisfaction with the disregard for Sichuan people's contributions to the revolution. Therefore, on this occasion of the reconstruction of the republic, they petitioned for the construction of a dedicated shrine to Peng Jiazhen on the site of his ancestral home and the place where he had rendered meritorious services.

Despite the frequent proposals, a long time passed in which the shrine to Peng Jiazhen was not constructed. Therefore, in March 1938, the family of Peng Jiazhen once more petitioned the Sichuan provincial government, pointing out that following the outbreak of

the War of Resistance, the famous people who had recently died as martyrs had all received special care, while there had still been no progress on a shrine and monument to Peng Jiazhen, who had died as a martyr during the restoration of the Republic. "Many years have passed since the event, and he will certainly fall into oblivion." As the memory of the new martyrs who fell during the War of Resistance was being generated, those martyrs of the 1911 Revolution who were still without memorials indeed risked being forgotten. The relatives of the martyr therefore selected the old site of the ever-normal granary of Jintang county as the site for the shrine.<sup>40</sup> The government of Jintang county also petitioned the Sichuan provincial government on this matter, stating that the site of the ever-normal granary approached the nature of a public park: "Everyone can easily see it: is it quite suitable for driving out evil and ushering in the good in popular morale."<sup>41</sup>

In 1940, the Sichuan Province Provisional Congress passed a resolution appealing for action on the commendations of the martyrs of Sichuan, so as to inspire the people's spirit of resistance against the Japanese; the resolution also noted pointedly that Peng Jiazhen had a grave in Beiping, but Beiping had already fallen into enemy hands. Meanwhile, "the place of his birth is relatively intact and is widely viewed as the base for the national revival." If martyrs were not commended, "how could later generations be roused and encouraged"?<sup>42</sup> It is clear that, during the war, Sichuan developed a special status, becoming the base of a revival in the Resistance against Japan. The Sichuan people themselves also realized this point and therefore placed more value on the matter of commending martyrs: Sichuan was one of the only surviving pieces of national territory that could preserve the memory of the revolution; furthermore, it was the place that could use the memory of the revolution to give strong encouragement to the people.

Although the War of Resistance was the reason for supporting the commemoration of martyrs, due to the straitened finances of the Sichuan provincial government during the war, in the end the provincial governor of Sichuan, Zhang Qun 張群, and the secretary-general, Li Bo 李伯, gave several thousand RMB in personal donations, while the scholar-gentry of Jintang county raised RMB10,000

in donations. Only then could they scrape together resources to construct the “Shrine to General Peng” at the old site of the ever-normal granary.<sup>43</sup> This dedicated shrine was a traditional building in the style of the local dwellings of western Sichuan: a wooden structure with a gray-tiled roof, with one-story buildings surrounding a square courtyard. The shrine occupied eight *mu* and had three buildings: one was provided for worshipping the spirit tablet of the martyr and displaying his relics; another was the residence of the martyr’s relatives; and the third was the main entrance to the dedicated shrine built of mud bricks.<sup>44</sup>

Because the shrine built during the war was too simple and crude, in 1946 the Sichuan Congress members again petitioned the government to allocate funds for the construction of a shrine to General Peng. The proposal stated that, before the war, many memorials had already been constructed for martyrs; during the War of Resistance, the government had also allocated funds for the construction of shrines and tending of tombs for Liu Xiang 劉湘 and others and had not halted construction due to financial straits. Furthermore, it had been nearly a year since the victory in the War of Resistance: therefore, the proposal earnestly requested the government to allocate funds for the construction of a shrine, “so as to display great trustworthiness and emphasize national principles.”<sup>45</sup> The decision on whether or not to allocate funds now implicated the trustworthiness of the government: the government’s procrastination not only showed insufficient respect for the martyrs but also demonstrated its renegeing on promises and inability to bolster its own legitimacy. Even so, the government replied that Peng Jiazhen’s memorial tablet should be integrated into the worship rites of Sichuan province martyrs’ shrines and the subordinate county and municipal martyrs’ shrines, denying the request to construct a dedicated shrine.<sup>46</sup> At the fifth congress, the congress members again passed a resolution expressing even more dissatisfaction:

Recall that when the national government returned to the capital from exile, in Chairman Chiang’s instructions just prior to leaving Chengdu, he still viewed Peng Jiazhen as a martyr of the revolution, one who effected the party-state’s splendid history and so on. Zhu Zhixin 朱执信, Deng Zhongyuan 鄧仲元, and Liao Zhongkai 廖仲愷 in Guangdong,

Chen Yingshi in Zhejiang, and Huang Xing in Hunan all have glorious and majestic shrines and tombs, memorial schools, and libraries. Later generations see this and are filled with deep veneration: this is the path to worshipping and burying the loyal and honest and transforming social conditions. The meritorious services of Peng Jiazhen are not inferior to those of the martyrs of other provinces, but he alone is forgotten and unpraised: those who know of him therefore say that the Sichuan government for many years has not been on the right path and has no time to show concern; those who do not know of him think mistakenly that the Sichuan people made no contribution to the revolution. Today, the Sichuan government has been united for over ten years: first, the central party clearly ordered the construction of a shrine and tomb for Peng Jiazhen; and second, there was Chairman Chiang's parting address. In terms of the funds the central party will not allocate, if the national treasury has difficulty bearing the burden, afar there are the statues and funerary parks to Liu Xiang, Wang Mingzhang 王銘章, and Xie Chi 謝持; the subsidies of the provincial government then would not matter. Near at hand, the provincial government has allocated RMB10 million for the use of repairs for those such as Lu Shidi 廬師諦 and Shi Qingyang 石青陽. Yet the shrine and tomb of Peng Jiazhen are decayed and rotten, no one cares about them, and there have been multifarious difficulties in receiving any relief. The shrine and tomb are withering, and no memorial rites can be held: those who see it are bitterly disappointed, and those who hear of it shed tears.<sup>47</sup>

The explicit stipulations of the central party and Chairman Chiang's parting address became promises the government could not keep: on the one hand, this caused people to question whether the government could execute its own aim of worshipping and holding funerals for the dead; on the other hand, this caused the people of Sichuan to feel that their province's contributions to the 1911 Revolution were being ignored. In comparison with the martyrs of other provinces, this appeared both unfair and wrong.

In fact, during the existence of the Nanjing National Government, there were certain disparities in terms of its attitude toward and construction efforts on the memorial spaces of the 1911 Revolution in various localities: in general, the Nationalist Party attached importance to the construction of shrines to the Yellow Flower Mound and named the memorial day for this uprising as the memorial day for the revolution. Meanwhile, insufficient value was

placed on the commemoration of the leaders of uprisings that did not fall into the Alliance mainstream. This incited dissatisfaction in some places and caused regional disparities in the memory of the revolution. In addition, the Nationalist Party regime became increasingly corrupt after the War of Resistance, and society became progressively more at odds with the Nationalist regime. The Nationalist Party's neglect of the construction of memorial spaces for some local revolutionary martyrs caused the people to compare their veneration of the martyrs of the revolution to the current corruption of the political regime, which naturally bred the idea that the Nationalist Party had betrayed the revolutionary martyrs. As a result, the local memory of the revolution gradually translated into a loss of faith in the central party regime.

## **Conclusion**

The construction of memorial space was not only political engineering but also cultural engineering. Since ancient times, China had always had a unique system of memorial space: it was tied to traditional funereal and sacrificial culture and had broad social influence. After the 1911 Revolution, China was in the initial stage of transformation from traditional to modern society: therefore, the symptoms of transition also manifested in its system of memorial space. Against this particular backdrop, the republican government converted traditional shrines to the fallen into modern martyrs' shrines and constructed a large quantity of new martyrs' shrines, enshrining spirit tablets, installing memorial tablets, and integrating traditional rites such as the burning of incense and sacrificial libations into memorial ceremonies, drawing on the sacredness of the shrine space to carry on the spirit of the 1911 Revolution and remold collective national memory.

The purely traditional form of the martyrs' shrine, however, did not completely meet the needs of remolding the memory of the 1911 Revolution. Although the martyrs' shrines of the republican era preserved the form of traditional shrines, their memorial ceremonies and interior displays were similar yet different from those of old-style shrines; they were multifunctional spaces integrating

worship and exhibition, which had transformed the traditional space for worship into a sacred vehicle for modern national memory. This caused the people who entered the space to feel respect and admiration for the martyrs and form a profound memory of the revolution.

Memorial spaces are not merely material or spiritual spaces but rather fields. The sociologist Pierre Bourdieu introduced the concept of a “field,” which is defined as “a network, a configuration, of objective relations between positions” and can be imagined as a “space within which an effect of field is exercised.” This type of space is not fixed: it contains many relationships, and therefore is a “space of conflict and competition,” a battlefield in which to vie for power and capital, and “the locus . . . of endless change.”<sup>48</sup> The memorial space of the 1911 Revolution is this type of field. Throughout the various complicated social vicissitudes of the republic, every sort of power vied over the martyrs’ shrines: situated in the center of the struggle for hegemony between the state and local regions, they exerted a special social function and influenced the formation of national and local memory.

## Notes

1. This article designates every type of shrine commemorating martyrs as martyrs’ shrines, including not only shrines commemorating multiple martyrs but also dedicated shrines commemorating one or several individual martyrs.

2. “Da Qing Shizong xian Huangdi shilu” (The Authentic Records of Qing Emperor Yongzheng), vol. 25: *Tenth Month of the Second Year of the Yongzheng Reign (1724)*, in *Qing shilu* (Authentic Records of the Qing Dynasty), vol. 7 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1985), 391.

3. “Lujunbu qing jiang qian Qing zhaozhong ge zhuan si fenbie gajian dahan zhonglie ci cheng” (Department of the Army Presents a Request that Qing Dynasty Shrines to the Fallen be Reconstructed as Shrines to Heroic Martyrs), in *Xinhai geming shiliao* (Historical Materials on the 1911 Revolution), ed. Historical Materials Group, Institute of Modern History, Chinese Academy of Sciences (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1961), 378–79.

4. The Xiang and Chu armies were raised in Hunan and led by General Zuo Zongtang; the Huai Army was led by Qing Minister Li Hongzhang.

5. “Lujunbu tonggao gesheng xun jiang qian Qing xiang chu huai jun zhaozhong ge ci gajian wei dahan zhonglie siwen” (Notice of the Department of the Army That Each Province Rapidly Reconstruct the Shrines to the Fallen of the Xiang, Chu, and Huai Armies as Shrines to Heroic Martyrs), in *Xinhai geming shiliao*, 176.

6. “Lujunbu junheng ju dian ge sheng biao yang Fujian Sun dufu yi qi fu zhuan si ru guan you” (Telegram from the Army Weights and Measures Office, Department of the Army, to Each Province Praising Governor Sun of Fujian for Confiscating the Shrine to His Father) (March 3, 1912), China’s Second Historical Archives Collections, file no. 26/33, “Nanjing linshi zhengfu junzhengbu: lujunbu kaiyi xushang zhuan tiao ji jiang qian Qing zhongyi ci caijian dahan zhonglie ci youguan wendian” (Nanjing Provisional Government, Ministry of War: Telegraphs on the Department of the Army’s Discussions on Special Funds for Bereaved Families and the Reconstruction of Qing Shrines to the Fallen as Shrines to Heroic Martyrs), February 1912.

7. Man Daqi, “Changde shi lieshi ci jianjie” (An Introduction to the Martyrs’ Shrines of Changde), in *Wuchang shouyi zhong de zhinang Liu Fuji* (The wise Liu Fuji of the Wuchang Uprising), ed. Zhou Xun (Chengdu: Tiandi chubanshe, 1997), 52–53.

8. “Jiang dudu pi” (Comments of Provincial Governor Jiang), in *Shaoxing Xushe jishi*, ed. Zhang Boyin (Shaoxing: Xushe, 1921), 15.

9. Shao Yueneng, Ma Shouchang, and others, in *Tengchong minglian shangxi* (Appreciation of Famous Tengchong Couplets), ed. Tengchong County Tourism Department (Kunming: Yunnan minzu chubanshe, 2006), 65.

10. “Yu Peilun da jiangjun ci’ yizhi yijiu” (Recollections of “Shrine to the Great General Yu Peilun”), *Neijiang ribao* (Neijiang Daily), April 5, 2009; Yu Zhongjue, “Neijiang meinian san yue ershijiu ri jinian Yu Peilun da jiangjun: bange shiji qian de jiyi” (Neijiang Commemorates the Great General Yu Peilun on March 29 Each Year: Remembering Half a Century Ago), *Neijiang wenshi* (Neijiang Literature and History), ed. CPPCC Committee and Learning Committee of Neijiang, Sichuan, vol. 23 (2006), 61–64.

11. “Da zongtong ling lujunbu zhunyu jianli Yang Zheng er lieshi zhuan ci bing bu si Wu Xiong Chen san lieshi wen” (Order of the President to the Department of the Army to Establish a Dedicated Shrine to the Two Martyrs Yang and Zheng, as well as the Three Martyrs Wu, Xiong and Chen), in *Xinhai geming shiliao*, 242–43.

12. “San lishi rusi zhisheng” (Records of the Worship of the Three Martyrs), “*Yueduo ribao*” *zengkan* (Supplement to *Yueduo Daily*), June 10, 1912, quoted in CPPCC Work Committee of Shaoxing County, Zhejiang Province, ed., *Shaoxing wenshi ziliao xuanji* (Selected Historical and Literary Materials on Shaoxing), vol. 4: *Xu Xilin shiliao* (Historical Materials on Xu Xilin) (1986), 123–24.

13. *Ibid.*, 124.

14. Wang Wenhao, “San lieshi rusi jinian ci” (Words Commemorating the Worship of the Three Martyrs), in *Shaoxing Xushe jishi*, 26.

15. “Xu Naipu deng shi’er ren zuzhi Xushe chengqing zhuanxiang li’ an wen” (Text Reporting the Record of the Petition of Xu Naipu and 12 Others to Organize Xu Society), in *Shaoxing Xushe jishi*, 16.

16. “Shaoxing Xushe yuanqi” (The Origin of the Shaoxing Xu Society), in *Shaoxing Xushe jishi*, 83–85.

17. “Shaoxing gongjii Xu lieshi” (Shaoxing Holds Public Memorial Ceremony for Martyr Xu), *Shenbao* (Shanghai News), 7th edition, July 13, 1920.

18. “Xianlie yiji” (Historical Remains of the Martyrs), *Wenhua yishu yuekan* (Literature and Art Monthly) 3 (1929): 21.

19. Li Jigu, “Guanyu Xu Xilin lieshi” (On the Martyr Xu Xilin), *Yijing* (Additional Rites) 21 (1937): 32.

20. Cai Yuanpei, “Xu lieshi sitang beiji” (Inscription at the Xu Martyr’s Shrine), in *Shaoxing wenshi ziliao xuanji*, vol. 4, 74.

21. Mao Naifeng, “Tao Junbao yuhai zhi wojian” (My Opinion on the Murder of Tao Junbao), in CPPCC Literary and Historical Materials Committee of Jiangsu Province, CPPCC Literary and Historical Materials Committee of Zhenjiang, *Xinhai Zhenjiang jiangjun lu* (Records of Zhenjiang Generals, 1911), ed. *Jiangsu wenshi ziliao* (Literary and Historical Materials on Jiangsu) editorial board (1997), 308–9.

22. “Guowuyuan zongli Xiong Xiling cheng da zongtong niken jiang yigu zhenjun zongcanmou Tao Junbao congyou baoxu, bing zhun qi zai yougong defang jianli zhuansi, qingjun caishi zun wen” (State Council Premier Xiong Xiling Presents: President Agrees to Generously Commend the Deceased Town Army Headquarters Commander Tao Junbao and Permits the Establishment of a Dedicated Shrine on the Site of His Contributions, Text of Decision), *Zhengfu gongbao* (Government Gazette) 534 (1913), 7.

23. Tao Fengxun, “Beigu shan Tao gong ci shimo ji” (A Record of the Tao Shrine on Beigu Mountain), in *Xinhai Zhenjiang jiangjun lu*, 345–46.

24. Memoirs of Tao Tianshen, arranged by Jiang Yang, “Wo de shushu Tao Junbao” (My uncle Tao Junbao), in *Xinhai Zhenjiang jiangjun lu*, 332–40.

25. Tao Fengxun, “Beigu shan Tao gong ci shimo ji,” in *Xinhai Zhenjiang jiangjun lu*, 346.

26. Wan Kuiyi, “Zhonglieshi de sanci rusi yishi,” in *Wuhua wenshi ziliao*, ed. CPPCC Committee of Wuhua District, Kunming, 124–25, 128–31.

27. Tang Xiangrong, “Xinhai Luanzhou Qiyi” (Luanzhou Uprising of 1911), in *Luanxian wenshi ziliao* (Literary and Historical Materials on Luan County), vol. 10 (1991), 200.

28. *Feng Yuxiang riji* (Diary of Feng Yuxiang), vol. 1 (October 10, 1923) (Jiangsu: Jiangsu guji chubanshe, 1992), 459.

29. Wen Cheng, “Taishan Luanzhou Qiyi lieshici, jinianbei” (The Martyrs’ Shrine and Monument to the Luanzhou Uprising on Mount Tai), in *Tai’an wenshi ziliao* (Literary and Historical Materials on Tai’an), ed. CPPCC Committee of Tai’an, Shandong Province, vol. 3 (1998), 42–43.

30. Liu Xiuchi, ed., *Taishan daquan* (The Complete Collection on Mount Tai) (Shandong: Shandong youyi chubanshe, 1995), 1094, 1041.

31. Feng Yuxiang, “Taishan Xinhai Luanzhou Qiyi lishisi beiji” (Inscribed Record of the Mount Tai 1911 Luanzhou Uprising Martyrs’ Shrine), in *Tai’an wenshi ziliao*, vol. 3, 31–32.

32. He Liping, “Feng Yuxiang yu Taishan Luanzhou Qiyi lieshici” (Feng Yuxiang and the Mount Tai Luanzhou Uprising Martyrs’ Shrine), *Taishan wenbo yanjiu* (Study by Mount Tai Museum), ed. Liu Jianxin (Ji’nan: Shandong huabao chubanshe, 2008), 141.

33. Shi Congzhou, “Zhengzhou de lieshici yu zhonglieshi” (The Martyrs’ Shrine and Loyal Martyrs’ Shrine of Zhengzhou), in *Guancheng wenshi ziliao* (Literary and Historical Materials on Guan Cheng), ed. Zhengzhou Guan Cheng Hui District Committee, Committee for Learning and Dissemination of Literary

and Historical Materials, vol. 2 (1990), 41–42; Li Jitong, “Lao Zhengzhou de lieshici” (The Martyrs’ Shrine of Old Zhengzhou), *Zhengzhou ribao* (Zhengzhou Daily), August 24, 2006.

34. “Zhejiang lieshici jinri juxing gongji” (Zhejiang Martyrs’ Temple Holds Public Memorial Ceremony Today), *Zhongyang ribao*, March 24, 1935, 7th ed.

35. “Zhejiang lüjing tongxiang zuo gongji guangfu Nanjing Zhejun lieshi” (Zhejiang Native Place Association Yesterday Held Public Memorial Ceremony for the Martyrs of the Zhejiang Army in the Restoration of Nanjing), *Zhongyang ribao*, March 25, 1935, 7th ed.

36. “Da zongtong ling Lujunbu fuxu Zou Xie Yu Peng ci lieshi wen” (The President’s Order to the Department of the Army to Comfort the Souls of the Four Martyrs Zou, Xie, Yu, and Peng), in *Xinhai geming shiliao*, 376–77.

37. “Ji geming siyi zhu lieshi wen” (Memorials for the Various Martyrs Who Died for Justice in the Revolution), in *Sun Zhongshan quanji* (The Complete Works of Sun Yat-sen), vol. 2 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1982), 147.

38. “Chuan dudu jingxu Peng lieshi” (Sichuan Provincial Governor Posthumously Honors Martyr Peng), *Shenbao*, May 21, 1912, 6th ed.

39. “Shu yiyuan wei Peng Jiazhen qingxu” (Sichuan Congress Members Petition for Care for Peng Jiazhen), *Shenbao*, March 4, 1917, 6th ed.

40. “Peng Jiazhen yishu cheng Sichuan sheng zhengfu” (Relatives of Peng Jiazhen Petition the Sichuan Provincial Government) (March 21, 1938), in *Yilie qianqiu: Peng Jiazhen da jiangjun* (Eternally Righteous: General Peng Jiazhen), ed. CPPCC Literary and Historical Materials Committee of Chengdu (Chengdu: Chengdu chubanshe, 1991), 85–86.

41. “Cheng wei cheng fu zunling huabo Peng lieshi jianzhu zhuansi jizhi yi an yangqi jian heshi zunyou” (Reply to Petition to Allocate Funds for the Construction of a Dedicated Shrine to Martyr Peng: Decision on the Case), May 25, 1938, Sichuan Provincial Archives, file no. 54-2-7488, “Sichuan shengfu guanyu xiujian lieshi Peng Jiazhen zhuansi libei jingfei di fangwu chanquan jiufen ji shengcan gonghan di shi qu zhuanshu jintang xianfu chengfu de xunling zhiling” (Directive of the Sichuan Provincial Government in Reply to the Collective Letter of the Provincial Congress and the Petition of the Tenth District Prefectural Commissioner and the Jintang County Government on the Expenses of and Property Dispute over the Construction of a Dedicated Shrine and Erection of a Monument to the Martyr Peng Jiazhen).

42. “Sichuan sheng linshi canyihui di er ci dahui ti’an di yi qi er hao” (Motion of the Second Congress of the Sichuan Province Provisional Congress, no. 172), April 5, 1940, in *Yilie qianqiu: Peng Jiazhen da jiangjun*, 90–91.

43. “Wang Qingzhen cheng Sichuan sheng zhengfu” (Wang Qingzhen Petitions the Sichuan Provincial Government), October 20, 1948, in *Yilie qianqiu: Peng Jiazhen da jiangjun*, 100; “Sichuan sheng canyihui di yi jie di wu ci dahui ti’an tizi di shiwu hao” (Motion of the First Session, Fifth Congress of the Sichuan Provincial Congress, Motion no. 15), January 14, 1948, in *Yilie qianqiu: Peng Jiazhen da jiangjun*, 98.

44. Peng Jiayang and Peng Fuyong, “Peng da jiangjun zhuansi” (The Dedicated Shrine to General Peng), in *Yilie qianqiu: Peng Jiazhen da jiangjun*, 219–20.

45. "Sichuan sheng canyihui di yi jie di er ci dahui ti'an ti erzi di qijiu hao" (Motion of the First Session, Second Congress of the Sichuan Provincial Congress, Motion no. 79), July 17, 1946, Sichuan Provincial Archives, file no. 54-2-7488.

46. "Ju cheng zhuanqing fakuan jianzhu Peng da jiangjun zhuansi an zhi chizhi zhaoyou" (Notice on the Petition for Allocation of Funds for the Construction of a Dedicated Shrine to General Peng), March 19, 1947, Sichuan Provincial Archives, file no. 54-2-7488; "Sichuan sheng zhengfu xunling gequ xianshi zhengfu minsan zi di ling qi san si si hao" (Order of the Sichuan Provincial Government to all County and Municipal Governments, Republic no. 07344), 1947, in *Yilie qianqiu: Peng Jiazhen da jiangjun*, 97.

47. "Sichuan sheng canyihui di yi jie di wu ci dahui ti'an tizi di shiwu hao," January 14, 1948, in *Yilie qianqiu: Peng Jiazhen da jiangjun*, 98.

48. Pierre Bourdieu and Loïc Wacquant, *An Invitation to Reflexive Sociology* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), 17, 97, 100, 103.

Copyright of Chinese Studies in History is the property of M.E. Sharpe Inc. and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.